

Exhibit 4

From: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
Sent: Tuesday, May 5, 2020 11:14 AM
To: Claudia Wilner
Cc: Joachim, Jordan S; Darius Charney; Britney Wilson
Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw

[EXTERNAL]

Thanks, this is helpful. I'll go through and try to respond but don't know that I'll have that done by 3 today. Would tomorrow afternoon be possible? I'm free the whole afternoon so will just suggest keeping 3 but don't have a preference.

-----Original Message-----

From: Claudia Wilner [mailto:wilner@nclej.org]
Sent: Tuesday, May 05, 2020 11:05 AM
To: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Hi Rob,

We hope you're doing okay. Can you speak at 3pm today? If not, please suggest another time.

In advance of our call, we wanted to raise some issues with the format of your ESI production. We outline them below and are happy to discuss them further on the call.

1. Metadata - The Court's December 19, 2019 Order granted Plaintiffs' motion to compel production of ESI in part and ordered Defendants to produce, for all documents, the date and time which emails were sent and received, the sender, and all recipients (including cc'd and bcc'd recipients), as metadata or in another format (e.g., a spreadsheet). Your latest productions includes only the underlying documents. Please produce all the items described in the Court's order as metadata or in a similar format.

2. Bates Numbers - You have produced some documents to us without bates numbers (e.g., the word files produced as attachments in your April 29 production). This makes it difficult for all parties to identify documents, and will only become a bigger problem when we begin depositions and trial. Please include bates numbers for all produced documents.

For native production of documents (such as Excel spreadsheets), we need one bates number for the entire native file. You can either produce a slip sheet, a spreadsheet with a bates number, or rename the file with the bates number. Word documents should ideally be produced as PDFs.

3. Separating Documents - Many of your productions have combined several documents into a single PDF, sometimes including hundreds or thousands of pages into a single PDF. This makes it burdensome and difficult for us to identify and separate out individual documents. Documents should be produced separately whenever they are maintained as such in the usual course of business, as required by Federal Rule 34(b) and Instruction No. 11 to Plaintiffs' RFPs.
4. Attachments - Similarly, all attachments should be produced as separate documents immediately after their corresponding parent documents with sequentially-numbered bates numbers. In the past, you have produced attachments in the same file as their parent emails, out of order, or as separate documents without any bates numbers. This can make it impossible to determine which attachments correspond with which parent documents. We should be able to tell which attachment goes with each email.
5. Text Searchable Format - Under the Court's December 19 Order, your productions must be "in a text-searchable format." Your April 24 production did not comply with this requirement (see COB014954-COB015949).
6. Status of Production - Please provide an update on the status of Defendants' ESI production, including which custodians and search terms have been produced to us and which are remaining.

Thanks in advance, and please let us know if you have any questions.

Claudia Wilner
Director of Litigation and Advocacy (pronouns she/her)
National Center for Law and Economic Justice
275 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1506, New York, NY 10001-6860
212-633-6967 | wilner@nclej.org | www.nclej.org

Confidentiality Note: This e-mail (including attachments) is intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is privileged and/or confidential. Distribution or copying of this e-mail or its attachments by anyone other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify us immediately by telephone at 212-633-6967 or e-mail at info@nclej.org and destroy the original message and all copies.

-----Original Message-----

From: Quinn, Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
Sent: Monday, May 4, 2020 11:04 AM
To: Claudia Wilner <wilner@nclej.org>
Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw

Actually I don't think I can make today work, sorry, I didn't check with my daycare/teaching bosses. Would tomorrow still work?

-----Original Message-----

From: Claudia Wilner [mailto:wilner@nclej.org]
Sent: Monday, May 04, 2020 9:35 AM
To: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Rob, can you do 1:30 or 2pm today?

Claudia Wilner
Director of Litigation and Advocacy (pronouns she/her)
National Center for Law and Economic Justice
275 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1506, New York, NY 10001-6860
212-633-6967 | wilner@nclej.org | www.nclej.org

Confidentiality Note: This e-mail (including attachments) is intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is privileged and/or confidential. Distribution or copying of this e-mail or its attachments by anyone other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify us immediately by telephone at 212-633-6967 or e-mail at info@nclej.org and destroy the original message and all copies.

-----Original Message-----

From: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
Sent: Thursday, April 30, 2020 5:22 PM
To: Claudia Wilner <wilner@nclej.org>
Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
Subject: Re: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw

Sure, Monday afternoon would best.

Sent from my iPhone

> On Apr 30, 2020, at 5:16 PM, Claudia Wilner <wilner@nclej.org> wrote:

>

> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

>

>
>
>
> Thanks Rob. We think it would be useful to have a conversation to discuss the format of production and related matters. Are you available on Monday or Tuesday of next week?
>
>
> Claudia Wilner
> Director of Litigation and Advocacy (pronouns she/her) National
> Center for Law and Economic Justice
> 275 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1506, New York, NY 10001-6860
> 212-633-6967 | wilner@nclej.org | www.nclej.org
>
>
>
>
>
>
>
>
> Confidentiality Note: This e-mail (including attachments) is intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is privileged and/or confidential. Distribution or copying of this e-mail or its attachments by anyone other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify us immediately by telephone at 212-633-6967 or e-mail at info@nclej.org and destroy the original message and all copies.
>
>
>
> -----Original Message-----
> From: Quinn, Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
> Sent: Wednesday, April 29, 2020 5:08 PM
> To: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Claudia Wilner
> <wilner@nclej.org>
> Cc: Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson
> <wilson@nclej.org>
> Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>
> I just uploaded three files. One is a tranche of emails, the others are the attachments from one of the emails in that tranche. I wanted to send these to you now before proceeding much further in processing these emails so it's a relatively smaller set.
>
> Please let me know if this format is acceptable and how you would like to handle production generally and specifically with respect to attachments. I'll have another tranche on Friday so let me know if there are any issues or questions before then.
>
> I expect that the rate and amount of production will increase substantially now that I have the data, but it will take some time to process, and there appears to be a substantial amount to go through.
>
> My plan is to produce once or twice a week as that's more efficient
> given the circumstance of working from home. Thanks
>
> -----Original Message-----
> From: Joachim, Jordan S [mailto:jjoachim@cov.com]

> Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 9:23 AM
> To: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>; Claudia Wilner
> <wilner@nclej.org>
> Cc: Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson
> <wilson@nclej.org>
> Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>
> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown
senders or unexpected emails.
>
>
>
>
> Rob,
>
> Confirming that we received two files (one with bates COB014954 to COB015517 and one with bates COB015518 to
COB015949). We look forward to your update today.
>
> Jordan
>
> -----Original Message-----
> From: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
> Sent: Friday, April 24, 2020 5:36 PM
> To: Claudia Wilner <wilner@nclej.org>
> Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney
> <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
> Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>
> [EXTERNAL]
>
> I uploaded two files to the link below. Please confirm you received and let me know if you would also want it sent
anywhere in the mail or otherwise. I will have an addition upload on Monday. Restoration of BPD emails is complete
and I expect to receive data and begin to process next week. There have been a few slight IT/COVID related delays in
getting data to D4, but expect that to be resolved on Monday and production should then accelerate. Once that
happens I'll have a better sense of the timing of completion, but will continue to produce on rolling basis. I'll follow up
further on Monday. Thanks.
>
>
> -----Original Message-----
> From: Quinn,Robert E
> Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 9:02 AM
> To: 'Claudia Wilner' <wilner@nclej.org>
> Cc: 'Joachim, Jordan S' <jjoachim@cov.com>; 'Darius Charney'
> <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; 'Britney Wilson' <wilson@nclej.org>
> Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>
> Slight delay in getting to the office so this will go out Friday.
> I've also received additional materials from Lt. Fahey and will be
> supplementing our prior responses then. We should be able to upload

> everything to the Covington's file sharing. I'll have an update this
> afternoon about the timing of the restored email production. Thanks
>

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Quinn,Robert E
> Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 8:22 AM
> To: 'Claudia Wilner' <wilner@nclej.org>
> Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney
> <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
> Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>

> I expect to produce a second tranche by Wednesday and will attempt to upload documents to system at that time. The data I'm expecting to receive this week are email accounts from BPD that had to be restored from tape. That data still has to be searched by terms, and I understand that that the amount is large, so I cannot give a precise date that those will be produced. Once I receive that data and start the search we should be able to get a sense of the timing as we work through it. I'll advise and produce on rolling basis during that process.
>

> I should be able to get into in the office at some point this week and will follow up then on this and any other questions.
>

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Claudia Wilner [mailto:wilner@nclej.org]
> Sent: Thursday, April 16, 2020 8:51 AM
> To: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
> Cc: Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com>; Darius Charney
> <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
> Subject: Re: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>

> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.
>
>
>
>

> Hi Rob, I hope you're well. I don't quite understand your email. Can you clarify when you intend to produce, what the production will consist of, and whether you will be able to upload the documents to Covingtons file-sharing system as explained below? Several weeks ago you said another tranche was almost ready for production but we have received nothing so far.

> Thanks,
> Claudia
>

> Sent from a phone
>

>> On Apr 14, 2020, at 2:55 PM, Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us> wrote:

>>

>> We're about 2/3 through the email restoration from backup. I believe the data should be available for our search next week. Due to the amount of data we've have to order a hard drive and delivery says Friday, so that shouldn't delay things, but just wanted to bring up given the stories about mail getting delayed.
>>

>> Sent from my iPhone

>>
>>>> On Apr 8, 2020, at 4:37 PM, Joachim, Jordan S <jjoachim@cov.com> wrote:
>>>
>>> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>> Rob,
>>>
>>> In terms of making the productions electronically, you are welcome to do so through Covington's file-sharing system. Just go to this link (<https://covington.kiteworks.com/w/zZyrxOJql1m7xDQq>), enter your email address and create an account, and then drag and drop the files you wish to upload. Please also send us an email so we can confirm receipt. If you encounter any technical problems using the site, feel free to reach out.
>>>
>>> Jordan
>>>
>>> -----Original Message-----
>>> From: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
>>> Sent: Wednesday, April 8, 2020 7:19 AM
>>> To: Claudia Wilner <wilner@nclej.org>
>>> Cc: Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Joachim, Jordan S
>>> <jjoachim@cov.com>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
>>> Subject: RE: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
>>> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>>>
>>> [EXTERNAL]
>>>
>>> I'm hoping to have a second tranche from D4 this week, if we can make available electronically I will. We're in the process of having the necessary police/lotus emails restored from backup. I don't have a precise timeline yet but they are working on it and my initial understanding based on the amount requested is that it would not take that long, (i.e., days or weeks, not months), but I'm not sure how the health crisis impacts this. I'm going to be able to get into the office for an hour tomorrow and will follow up further then.
>>>
>>> -----Original Message-----
>>> From: Claudia Wilner [mailto:wilner@nclej.org]
>>> Sent: Monday, March 30, 2020 12:52 PM
>>> To: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>
>>> Cc: Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Joachim, Jordan S
>>> <jjoachim@cov.com>; Britney Wilson <wilson@nclej.org>
>>> Subject: Re: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of
>>> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw
>>>
>>> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>> Thanks for the update Rob. I'm sorry to hear you've been ill and wish you and your family the best.
>>>

>>> We are also looking forward to hearing the D4 update, and updates on the numerous other pending items, when you are able.

>>>

>>> Sent from a phone

>>>

>>>> On Mar 30, 2020, at 11:04 AM, Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us> wrote:

>>>>

>>>> As an update, and without getting to far into it, I'm in self-isolation due to experiencing corona symptoms last weekend. I've been working and following up by email as best as possible given everything that's going on but it has certainly made things more difficult. Physically back to close to normal now so I'll follow up in the next few days re: D4. I then expect to have improved work from home capacity starting Thursday, as long as everything goes as planned, and should have more follow up on Friday or early next week. Hope everyone's doing ok, stay safe, and let me know if there are any questions.

>>>>

>>>> Sent from my iPhone

>>>>

>>>>> On Mar 19, 2020, at 3:15 PM, Claudia Wilner <wilner@nclej.org> wrote:

>>>>>

>>>>> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> Thanks Rob. I've copied our co-counsel Jordan Joachim from Covington and Britney Wilson of NCLEJ who will be helping to fill Travis's shoes. Please include them on future emails.

>>>>>

>>>>> We are all working from home and certainly understand the difficulties.

>>>>>

>>>>> That said, last week you said you had enlisted the services of D4 and that we could expect an additional production last Friday, but we have not received anything yet. Is D4 still working on this and when can we expect to receive the next production? Also, given current circumstances we would like to find a way for you and/or D4 to upload the files directly to us rather than delivering CDs to the WNYLC office which poses unnecessary risks to all. We can provide instructions to make this easy but would need to know who would be doing the uploading.

>>>>>

>>>>> Thanks and stay well.

>>>>> Claudia

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> -----Original Message-----

>>>>> From: Quinn,Robert E <rquinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us>

>>>>> Sent: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:03 PM

>>>>> To: Travis England <england@nclej.org>

>>>>> Cc: Darius Charney <dcharney@ccrjustice.org>; Claudia Wilner

>>>>> <wilner@nclej.org>

>>>>> Subject: Re: Black Love Resists in the Rust, et al. v. City of

>>>>> Buffalo, et al. - Motion to Withdraw

>>>>>

>>>>> Saw this motion, no objection fwiw. We've been out of the office with state mandates and school closures. Im going to try to get into the office tomorrow and will follow up with a status of where we are. Apologize for not reaching out sooner, as I imagine you all know as well as anybody, its been a crazy few days.

>>>>>

>>>>> Hope everyone is safe and doing ok. Thanks.

>>>>>

>>>>> Rob Quinn

>>>>>

>>>>> Sent from my iPhone

>>>>>

>>>>> On Mar 18, 2020, at 11:12 AM, Travis England <england@nclej.org> wrote:

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> Dear Rob,

>>>>>

>>>>> I hope this email finds you well. I'm writing to let you know that shortly I will be filing a motion to withdraw as counsel for plaintiffs in this litigation. Effective tomorrow, I'll be leaving the employment of NCLEJ and joining the New York Attorney General's Office Civil Rights Bureau. The remainder of Plaintiffs' counsel will stay the same for the time being. May I state in the motion that Defendant does not object to the motion?

>>>>> All the best,

>>>>> Travis

>>>>>

>>>>> <image005.jpg>

>>>>>

>>>>> Travis W. England

>>>>> Co-Director of Litigation and Advocacy

>>>>> Pronouns: He/His

>>>>> National Center for Law and Economic Justice

>>>>> 275 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1506, New York, NY 10001-6860

>>>>>

>>>>> 212-633-6967 | england@nclej.org<mailto:england@nclej.org> |

>>>>> www.nclej.org<<http://www.nclej.org/>>

>>>>>

>>>>> <<https://interland3.donorperfect.net/weblink/weblink.aspx?name=E83>

>>>>> 594&id=1>

>>>>> <image003.jpg>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> <<https://www.facebook.com/NCLEJ/>>

>>>>> <image004.jpg>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> Confidentiality Note: This e-mail (including attachments) is intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is privileged and/or confidential. Distribution or copying of this e-mail or its attachments by anyone other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify us immediately by telephone at 212-633-6967 or e-mail at info@nclej.org<mailto:info@nclej.org> and destroy the original message and all copies.

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>